



The Following is a transcript of a telephone interview between Toronto Star reporter Dale Brazao and MP Ruby Dhalla, followed by a series of email exchanges between the Toronto Star and Ms. Dhalla.

Telephone interview with Ruby Dhalla, MP Brampton-Springdale on allegations from caregivers that she hired them illegally to work at the Mississauga home she shares with her mother Tavinder, and brother Neil.

(Preamble: Reporter Dale Brazao tells MP Dhalla that a nanny raised complaints about treatment by the Dhalla family at a recent public meeting held by Labour Minister Peter Fonseca and Education Minister Kathleen Wynne. Reporter Brazao asks if Dhalla knows the nanny.)

Dhalla: Okay

Brazao: Her name is Magdelene. Do you know her?

Dhalla: Yeah.

Brazao: So she made some pretty strong allegations at this meeting, saying that you promised to sponsor as a live in caregiver and that didn't come about and that you had taken her passport for the three weeks and held it while she worked there.

Dhalla: ahhhh, I can check, I've never held anyone's passport, to be honest. We've had two individuals and one of the individuals had an emergency and left.

I can check into the situation.

I think Magdelene left on her own willingness. Sometimes these nannies leave on their own will. I can check into what happened, my mom deals with all of that.

Brazao: Right

Dhalla: I know we've never held money from any nanny and everyone who has ever worked is paid and we have receipts with their signatures on it proving that they've been paid.

Brazao: Okay, in this case she says she worked there for three weeks and that she had not been paid. I believe the agreement between you and her was for \$1,000 a month.

She left after three weeks and that she spent the next month trying to get paid, and that your mom finally showed up at a McDonald's at Square One with \$400 in a bag. And that's how she was paid but only after repeated requests for payment.

Dhalla: I'll have my mom... because I'm not involved in any of this at all because I'm in Ottawa four days a week and I just know that any individual that ever come to work with us in any capacity has always been paid, they've been paid on time, I don't know what the circumstances were with Magdalene.

I know that Magdalene. Any nanny that we've had to work for us, we've only had two, one of them worked for us for a while and it was a very great relationship. I know that Magdalene did come in and left of her own will. She was paid we've never held a dollar from anyone, because they deserve to be paid for the work that they've done.

Brazao: Okay. But my understanding is that you don't have any children, right you're single?

Dhalla: Yeah.

Brazao: So they're caregivers for who?

Dhalla: These are my mother's nannies. My mother lives... Magdalene would've worked at my mother's home, not at mine.

Brazao: Okay, but you live there at the home, she said. There was you, your brother and your mom living at that house.

Dhalla: I am in Ottawa four days a week and I also have a home in Brampton as well.

Brazao: Right but at that time. Okay, but is your mom eligible for a nanny because you have to be I guess infirm and quite elderly and I understand your mother is quite healthy and very young.

Dhalla: She is actually..I can get you the information with regards to Magdalene once I speak to my mother I can get back to you with all the details.

Brazao: Okay.

Dhalla: A sponsorship for live in caregivers you have to go through HRSDC for the approval of the application.

Brazao: Right

Dhalla: And as the application as only approved by HRSDC for individuals that have young children or elderly that require care

Brazao: Right

Dhalla: Without going into my mother's history there has been a situation where she has required care, and that's why we had someone in the house to be able to assist with that.

Brazao: So you've only had the two? The two nannies you said.

Dhalla: Yes

Brazao: Was there a problem with the second one Lynn, who came in after Magdelene?

Dhalla: Not that I remember, no.

Brazao: Well do you recall at all Lynn went to Intercede and complained that you had her passport.

Dhalla: We've never held anyone's passport because at the end of the day, these passports, the passport photocopy is needed to send in to HRSDC and a passport would only be taken to obtain a photocopy to send in to HRSDC. The passport is the property of the individual of the nanny.

Brazao: Well, let me, to be fair to you Ruby...

Dhalla: People go and make allegations against me for everything..in terms of that the passport is taken to obtain a photocopy to send in to HRSDC and the passport is immediately returned to an individual.

Both of the nannies who have worked in our home have been treated extremely well. I mean my mom, instead of them doing half the work, my mom, even though she required the care, ended up making food for them.

So she's looked after them from giving clothes to them, giving you know many, no only shoes but giving them a whole host of things, and they've only been treated with love, with care and compassion.

Brazao: Okay, what about the fact that they've had to clean your clinics, your chiropractic clinics. Take there to clean those things, that certainly does not qualify..

Dhalla: I can have, I mean the best person for you to interview would have to be my mom, because I'm in Ottawa four days a week, and I wouldn't know anything about that.

Brazao: You wouldn't know whether a..

Dhalla: All the clinics that we have, I don't think they've ever been taken to clean any of our clinics because our clinics all have cleaners. And I' not involved. I'm not involved with any of the clinics.

Brazao: You have three of them right.

Dhalla: Pardon me?

Brazao: You are co-owner with your brother of three..

Dhalla: No I'm not a co-owner of any of the clinics..

Brazao: At one time you were?

Dhalla: Not since I got into politics five years ago.

Brazao: It's your brother's clinics, then?

Dhalla: Pardon me?

Brazao: These are your brother's clinics.

Dhalla: Yeah, I don't have anything to do with the clinics.

Brazao: Okay. Let me tell you something else. I understand that Service Canada phoned your home, and that there was a complaint from one of these nannies and that Service Canada denied there were any nannies working at the home. That your brother then chewed her out for going behind his back or somethingmy understanding is that she called to find out why it was taking so long to get a sponsorship from you, and that she was told there was no sponsorship. And so I guess Service Canada may have phoned the home to find out what was going on there, and that your brother got very angry with this person and that she left. And she left her passport behind and had to get Intercede to go in and get it for her.

Dhalla: I don't what type of allegations any of these women are making and this is the first I'm hearing about this stuff, both in terms of your statements that they had to clean clinics to their passports being kept and not being paid.

I can follow up on all of this but I certainly know that anyone who has ever worked in our home has been treated with a lot of love, with a lot of care and compassion and money has never ever been withheld from anyone, because anyone who knows my mom, knows she has the biggest heart.

Brazao: Is it possible for me speak to your mom, maybe tomorrow I can call her and put these things to her and see how she responds.

Dhalla: yeah, if you want to send me an email and put the questions in writing, because knows she has the biggest heart.

Brazao: Is it possible for me to speak to your mom, tomorrow I can call her put these things to her and see how she responds>

Dhalla: Yes, if you wanted to send me an equity mail in writing. People making allegations being in public office, people make allegations all the time and I know from my end, any time I was in the home they were only treated with love, with care and compassion.

I have nannies who come into my office as a member of parliament and who I try to go out of my way to help, so I don't know the type of allegations these women are making and I don't know for what reason and whose behind it..

Brazao: Well, the allegations Ms Dhalla, is exactly as I've put them.

Dhalla: Oh, okay. Well what exactly did they say because this is the first I'm hearing about it.

Brazao: Well, A, that they were overworked, that the general day at the home, now you say is not your house, they believed it to be your home, they were interviewed by you and your mom for the job.

Dhalla: I have not interviewed any of these nannies.

Brazao: You have not interviewed any of the nannies?

Dhalla: No I've been in the home when they've been there but I've not interviewed any of the nannies. Other than talking to them and asking about them.

Brazao: Well they call it interviews.

Dhalla: Okay.

Brazao: They were sent to you by an agency called Akemi.

Dhalla: Yeah. It was referred to me by a friend.

Brazao: Mostly its about being overworked that a typical day started at 8 o'clock until 10 11 12 o'clock at night. That your brother comes home late from the clinics they must prepare him meals. Your mother needs till at 11 so they're still up.

Dhalla: My mother actually goes to bed at 10 o'clock at night.

Brazao: Okay.

Dhalla: Another false allegation. What else did they say?

Brazao: That no contract was offered to them, no formal contract which is the beginning of the process for an LMO, whether its you or your mom, with the nanny, that no such thing exists, that you promised them both, that you would get them, that you're an MP and you work in Ottawa and you could get these things quick and that they are not forthcoming.

And that by working for you they were actually working illegally, because the way the system works if you're hiring a nanny, you must have an LMO and a work permit before they actually begin working for you.

Is that not the way you understand it?

Dhalla: From my knowledge they were all working legally.

Brazao: But they came in to work for someone else, they were released they went to an agency and then they went to work for you.

Dhalla: Yeah and they have to submit documentation to submit to HRSDC from my understanding, and that documentation was always submitted to HRSDC.

Brazao: Well did you submit applications on behalf of these ladies?

Dhalla: No I have not made applications on their behalf. That's what I'm sayng I'm jotting your concerns so I can discuss this with my mom and my brother. I am only giving you the information for the knowledge that I have. That's it.

Brazao: But,...

Dhalla: I have not been involved or through my office in any way shape or form for HRDC approval or an LMO.

Brazao: I understand that. But that's their frustration in speaking to you promised them to sponsor them to be live-in caregivers and that was not forthcoming.

Dhalla: That's not correct.

Brazao: Well if you didn't sponsor them to be live in caregivers, then why were they working in your home if they came to Canada...

Dhalla: You're saying did I personally sponsor them... (to come to Canada)

Brazao: No, no, no.

Dhalla: They can make allegations against me personally because I'm in public office, but to this day I have not sponsored anyone as a live in caregiver.

Brazao: Well, then they shouldn't be working for you because they came in as caregivers under the Live in Caregiver program and can only can only work as

Dhalla: They're not working for me, that's what I'm telling you.

Brazao: They were working for your mom.

Dhalla: Yes they were there working for the family, not for me.

Brazao: Okay, and you don't live at that house. I mean they saw you there from Thursday to Monday morning.

Dhalla: Yeah, sometimes I'm there and I also have another home in Ottawa and I'm back and forth...

Brazao: We're talking last January and February.

Dhalla: Yes, but I have not sponsored anyone as a live in caregiver.

Brazao: I guess I'm at a loss to understand because I for the last three months have done nothing but live in caregiver stories and I've got quite an education in it..including speaking to government officials in Ottawa about how the program works, what it's supposed to do, how it operates.

My understanding is that you cannot, if someone is working in your home, as a live in caregiver, she must have an lmo, a labour market opinion, in your name

Dhalla: That's correct.

Brazao: And a work permit in your name.

Dhalla: Yeah.

Brazao: So you acknowledge at least two caregivers were in your home so how did they get there. How were they working? Where they working as cleaners?

Dhalla: You are asking me these questions and I am telling you that the best person to me to speak with first of all to get you the right information, is my mother and my brother, and from. I would not be giving you the correct information that you deserve. I'm hearing the stuff for the first time, and obviously I'm quite shocked.

And the only thing I can tell you from a personal perspective is number 1, anyone who has worked in our home, from the time I've been there with my mom and my brother, they've been treated with love, with care and compassion.

Anyone who knows my mother knows she's an individual of tremendous generosity, and of tremendous compassion. I have seen first hand in the time that I've been in the home of her actually treat both these girls you mentioned with love and with respect. To get the details on the other things you mentioned I will follow up with my mom to be able to get back to you with the right information.

Brazao: Okay, In the morning I will send you an email with the questions that...

Dhalla: You can send me all the information and I will make sure that I will follow up and get you all the details that you need so that there is no confusion.

You can appreciate that being in public life, there are individuals that will make any such allegation. I have to ensure that the integrity of such a thing is protected. And I will get you the right answers from the people who can get you the right answers. Which is my mother and my brother.

Brazao: I did interview Magdalene, at length over the last couple days. Her story to me is this. She was interviewed by both you and your mom, at your home office, or at the house. That this was on a Friday, that she went home to, start on the Monday.

When she came back you asked for her passport so that you could take care of sponsoring her, getting her an LMO and a work permit as a live in caregiver.

She gave you that passport, you held that passport for three weeks.

After three weeks of realizing you were not sponsoring her as a caregiver, she then decided to leave because it was dead time for her, as a live in caregiver she has to work 24 months within 36 in order to qualify for landed status.

When she realized that was not happening with your family. She gave you notice she was leaving, you became furious with her, swore at her, called her names, and basically she bolted from the home without her belongings, she left a bag behind.

Dhalla: I've never raised my voice with anyone.

Brazao: So you didn't call her any names.

Dhalla: Sorry I'm just eating. If you can send me all of this stuff, I'm going to follow up on all of this, because this is completely incorrect.

Brazao: Okay, now, sometime later she said she returned to the home, with a cab driver in a snowstorm and she rang the doorbell and was in your driveway for two hours, she knows you were inside and that she kept phoning you and that you refused to answer but at one point you answered and that you said you were going to call the police and have her deported, because she is a newcomer here, she has no rights, and you are a very powerful person in Ottawa.

Dhalla: This is completely, completely absurd.

Brazao: but I am giving it to you as I've got them. My due diligence...

Dhalla: This is simply not true.

At the end of the day your name is everything. I never even heard of anything like this until you're telling me the story right now, so I'm in a bit of a shock.

Brazao: So at not time did you yell at this woman in your home

Dhalla: Never, ever.

Brazao: And you didn't keep your passport for three weeks.

Dhalla: Her passport, I know, was taken to photocopy and I will double check with my mom and my brother as to the status of obtaining an LMO for her because I think that was also done for her.

Brazao: Well, if your mom has a copy of an LMO that was for her that would be great.

Dhalla: Yeah, I will try to get that. Because my name and reputation is everything to me and I've worked extremely hard to get to where I am. I don't want anyone, in any way shape or form jeopardizing all the work that I have done.

I have gone out of my way to help many nannies in my office. I have never ever used my name to let any of these individuals know that I will obtain anything for them, because I have never sponsored anyone to this day.

Brazao: Well then, if you have never sponsored anyone to this day why would you need their passports.

Dhalla: You asking the passports were taken for the photocopying, not for sponsoring, so I have not taken this individual's passport.

Brazao: So if she's telling me she handed you her passport personally...and you took

Dhalla: I would never ever take anyone's passport..

Brazao: Okay:

Dhalla: I'm at a loss to be honest, why this stuff is being said..I really appreciate you calling me and letting me know this stuff otherwise I would never know anything about it. And if you can send the questions in detail, I would really really appreciate it because I'm going to get to the bottom of it.

I know my mother for a fact, she's a single mother who raised my brother and I and she's the most generous person in the world...and I don't know what would prompt someone to make allegations of this nature and of this sort.

But anyone who has ever worked in our home, my mom she's paid everyone, she signed a receipt we have copies, she keeps copies of everything.

Brazao: Well if the nanny says she worked in your home for 3 weeks and she was told she was getting \$250 a week but was only paid \$400 it sounds to me she was short-changed there but I guess its your word against hers.

Dhalla: There will be receipts and paper work my mom never gives any one any money without getting a receipt.

Brazao: Yeah, she said she signed a scrap piece of paper at McDonalds.

Dhalla: My mom would have given her. I will be able to talk to my mom and make sure we get all the details.

Brazao: You've never promised anyone that you would sponsor them as a live in caregiver, for your mom...

Dhalla: I've never promised anyone that I would sponsor as a caregiver, and that's 100 per cent and completely incorrect.

Brazao: Okay, because she says, the conversation she had with you..

Dhalla: This thing she said that I yelled at her, that she bolted from the home I've never even raised my voice with anyone.

Brazao: Okay she said it was quite vicious and you were very angry with her to the point that.

Dhalla: Anyone that knows me knows I am not that type of individual.

Brazao: Do you know about her leaving her bag behind and having to return?

Dhalla: No sir because I live in Ottawa from Monday to Thursday and if you send me all of these questions you have, I promise you that I will get the details. You can imagine right now I'm a little bit shocked, and very shocked actually, I'm at a loss for words because nothing of this sort has ever happened.

Brazao: Okay. Now they said there have been three nannies that have gone to work for you. There was another woman, Lyda, that lasted about a week.

Dhalla: If you send me all the details I will follow up on everything for you.

Brazao: and could you specifically ask about, they mention working at your clinics, you say they are not your clinics any more. They are your brother's clinics, they are not your clinics anymore.

Dhalla: No I have nothing to do on the clinics for the last five years

Brazao: They were taken to work at a clinic, I mean they've got the address. Unless they are all lying about having to work there..

Dhalla: The addresses are very easy to obtain.

Brazao: So you're saying they never worked at the clinic.

Dhalla: If you send me all the information I promise I will get back to you because you're putting me in a situation where I'm just hearing about this for the first time. The majority of what you told me is, the information involving me is completely not correct, and I know my mother, and I've worked very hard to get to where I am I know my mother is an individual of love compassion and care and I will make sure that you get all the information that you need.

The information they've told you about me is incorrect.

Brazao: Getting back to the point of being able to hire a caregiver, I believe that before the caregiver can start working for you the permit must be in hand and the LMO must be in hand and in neither of these cases you couldn't have had them in hand because they were sent to you by an agency that...

Dhalla: I've never sponsored anyone. Send me all the information and I'll be more than happy to get back to you. You can imagine that I'm a loss for words and I'm very shocked. I will send you all the information because I have nothing to hide and I will send you all the information that you need.

Brazao: I can also tell you that I checked with an agency called Intercede and they acknowledge that they intervened on behalf of a nanny to get her passport back..

Dhalla: I don't even know Intercede: I've never spoken to anyone there. What is Intercede?

Brazao: An agency that advocates on behalf of caregivers and nannies and that they had a complaint from a caregiver that worked in your home and they had to intervene to get it back or phone somebody about getting the passport back.

Dhalla: Before you do any type of story I would hope you get all the facts and details because you can appreciate me being in public life there is a lot of stuff that is said and there are a lot of rumours and allegations that are made and I want to make sure that we get you all the facts.

Brazao: I can tell you that I've also spoken to Akemi.

Dhalla: Yes

Brazao: And she confirms that she had complaints from these nannies, and that she had complaints from these nannies and that they all complained of being overworked. Three nannies sent to your home, three complaints of being overworked, complaints of being taken to clinics to clean that have nothing to do with caregiving program...so unless they are all lying...

Dhalla: Send me your list of questions and I will be more than happy to get back to you on all that stuff.

Brazao: Okay, I will do that. Thank you very much.

(Email from MP Ruby Dhalla to reporter Dale Brazao. April 30, 2009)

Dr Ruby Dhalla
Member of Parliament, Brampton-Springdale
Opposition Critic for Multiculturalism & Youth
270 Orenda Rd, Unit B Brampton, ON L6T 4X6
Tel: 905 874 6868 Fax: 905 874 1415
www.rubydhalla.ca
Email: dhallr1@parl.gc.ca

Dear Dale

I hope you are well. I am just following up in regards to our conversation yesterday. As you can imagine I was quiet shocked. I have worked hard to get to where I am and have always conducted myself with the highest integrity.

I hope any story you write will be based on fact and not fiction.

Best,
Ruby

(Dale Brazao's email to Ruby Dhalla, April 30, 2009)

Dear Ms Dhalla:

As per your request I am forwarding you a list of questions regarding the allegations raised by nanny Magdalene Gordo, who says she was hired by you personally, and worked for your family at [xxx] Mississauga.

Gordo says she was promised pay of \$1,000 a month. Gordo said at the time she worked there, between Feb 1 and Feb 22 of 2008 the home was occupied by you, your mother Tavinder, and brother Neil.

As I related to you in our phone conversation last night, Gordo made allegations at a public meeting hosted by Ontario minister of Labor Peter Fonseca and Education Minister Kathleen Wynne.

The meeting was called to announce the provincial government's "nanny hotline" and the dozens of nannies in attendance were urged by Fonseca and Wynne not to be afraid to speak up if they believed their rights had been infringed by employers.

So Gordo took up the invite and spoke up you saying she had worked illegally for you for three weeks, and that it took her almost a month after she left to get paid what she was owed.

I have since interviewed Ms Gordo and also Akemi Taniguchi, the agency owner who says she provided three caregivers for your family in the last year. She also said she dealt exclusively with you on the placements and that you promised to expedite the paperwork to hire these nannies as live-in caregivers.

In view of these allegations here are the questions I needed answered.

1)The rules governing hiring of foreign caregivers stipulate that they must have both a Labor Market Opinion and a work permit in the name of their employers before they can began working at a household. Gordo said she did not have the proper permits to work legally for your family. The first step to obtaining an LMO and a work permit is a formal work contract signed by both the employer and the employee. Gordo said she was not offered one by you or anyone in your household. Was she? If not, why not?

2)Ms Gordo says she was interviewed for the job by you and your mother at the family home at [xxx]. She said your former nanny Lyda Alvarez was also present. She said she took the job because you promised to fill out the proper paperwork for her to work legally as a caregiver. Did you make such a promise? Was any LMO ever obtained for Gordo?

3)Ms Akemi says she dealt exclusively with you in placing three nannies at your family home. She also said she apprised you that Gordo had complained to her about not being

paid and that you told her it had been take care about not being paid, and you said it had been taken care of. Is this true?

4)Ms Akemi says you told her you could expedite the paperwork because of your position as an MP. Was any application made to sponsor Gordo as a caregiver, either by you or your mother. Why not?

4)Ms Gordo alleges on one occasion she was taken to clean one of your family clinics in Mississauga. Your mother drove her there, and Sonya, who she believes is your cousin, and assistant, was also present when she cleaned the clinic. Is this true?

5)Under the Live-in Care program rules, a homeowner is not allowed to share, or subcontract a nanny to anyone else. Ms Gordo says she was taken to clean Sonya's house on three occasions. She also says she shoveled snow until midnight. These duties have nothing to do with care giving. Did she clean Sonya's house? Did she shovel snow?

6)Ms Gordo says that shortly after you hired her, you requested her passport ostensibly to start the LMO application to hire here legally. She says you kept the passport in your possession until she left three weeks later. Is this true?

7)Gordo says that when she realized neither you nor your mother were in a position to sponsor her as a caregiver, you don't have any children and your mom is neither elderly or infirm, she decided to seek legal employment elsewhere. She claims you blew up at her and she left without being paid. Was she paid? Why not. She says she returned to the family home week later and that you threatened to have her deported unless she left your property. She claims a cab driver witnessed the entire incident. Did this happen?

8)Ms Gordo says it took her almost a month after leaving to get her paid. Your mom met her at McDonalds at Square One and paid her \$400 in cash. Why cash and not a cheque? Can we see the receipt? Is it dated?

9) Anyone hiring a nanny as a live in caregiver must submit the appropriate taxes to the federal government on behalf of the employee. Was this done by either you or your family on behalf of Gordo?

10)After Gordo's departure, you hired another nanny who goes by the name of "Lynn". The Akemi agency says they dealt with you on this hiring also. It is my understanding that Lynn became concerned that her LMO was not forthcoming she phoned Service Canada to inquire about her status and whether you had applied for an LMO for her. Service Canada apparently called your home and your brother Neil took the call. He then admonished "Lynn" for having the nerve to inquire about her status. She left and some time later sought help from Intercede, a Toronto social agency that helps nannies, telling counselors there that you had her passport. Intercede acknowledges they got involved in getting her passport back. Can you comment on this? When was Lynn's passport returned to her? By whom? Why was it kept in the first place. Did you or anyone in your family ever apply for an LMO or a work permit for her?

These are the questions I have for now.

Thank you.

LAW OFFICE OF H. JOHN KALINA

7895 Tranmere Drive, Suite 214, Mississauga, Ontario Canada L5S 1V9

Telephone: (905) 456-8055
1-866-503-7354
Facsimile: (905) 487-9613

mail@lawyer4u.ca
www.lawyer4u.ca

Friday, May 01, 2009

Refer to File Number: M09999

Sent by email to dbrazao@thestar.ca

Dale Brazao, Reporter
The Toronto Star
1 Yonge Street
Toronto, Ontario

RE: Dr. Ruby Dhalla

Dr. Dhalla has asked me to respond to the allegation and questions put to her in regard to allegations made by three live-in care-givers who had worked for members of her family.

Dr. Dhalla's response is:

"I am shocked and appalled by these allegations. The allegations made against me are false and baseless. I had no involvement in selecting, interviewing, hiring, supervising, sponsoring or any financial transactions whatsoever with a live-in care-giver for my family."

As Dr. Dhalla has no knowledge of the details regarding the live-in care-givers for her family, I have asked Neil Dhalla to prepare a response to your questions. That response is attached.

It is our position that whatever misconceptions people may have had regarding Dr. Ruby Dhalla's role within the family and her ability or desire to become involved, those misconceptions were entirely self-generated and not as a result of any words or actions from Dr. Dhalla or her family.

Should you have any questions or concerns please contact us at our office.

Sincerely,



H. John Kalina
Encls.

Cc: Dr. Ruby Dhalla, Dr. Neil Dhalla

Statement from Dr Neil Dhalla

May 1 2009

The allegations being made against my family are false and baseless.

Due to my mother's personal health reasons, a live in caregiver was referred to my family by a placement agency. The live in caregivers that were hired were treated with the utmost respect, care and compassion.

At no time were any passports or documentations withheld from the individuals. All information provided by both the agency and live in caregivers were trusted to be accurate and in good faith. To my knowledge, all legal documentation required was submitted for appropriate processing of which I have proof. One of the live in caregivers in question was caught impersonating a family member to enquire about the status of her application. At that time it was decided to terminate her application.

All other employees left of their own accord. Each of them elected to move elsewhere for unknown personal reasons. All live in caregivers were paid with appropriate receipts acknowledging payment was received.

In no way shape or form has my sister been involved. I hope my family and I are not being used as a scapegoat to deflect attention from their possible misrepresentations and any current legal difficulties that these live in caregivers may be facing.

Questions and Responses

Received by email from Dale Brazao, Toronto Star Reporter on April 30, 2009 at 3:29pm.

1) The rules governing hiring of foreign caregivers stipulate that they must have both a Labor Market Opinion and a work permit in the name of their employers before they can begin working at a household. Gordo said she did not have the proper permits to work legally for your family. The first step to obtaining an LMO and a work permit is a formal work contract signed by both the employer and the employee. Gordo said she was not offered one by you or anyone in your household. Was she? If not, why not?

Ms. GORDO HAD ADVISED TAVINDER DHALLA SHE WAS ON AN OPEN WORK PERMIT AND HAD ALL THE LEGAL DOCUMENTS REQUIRED TO WORK. MRS. DHALLA REQUESTED A COPY FOR PROOF NUMEROUS TIMES AND ALSO REQUESTED FOR INFORMATION TO COMPLETE THE PAPERWORK TO START THE PROCESSING FOR HER TO WORK IN THE DHALLA HOME. HOWEVER MS. GORDO DID NOT PROVIDE THE INFORMATION. ON EACH OCCASSION THAT MS. GORDO WAS ASKED SHE STATED WHEN SHE WOULD GO TO HER HOME ON THE WEEKEND SHE WOULD BRING ALL OF THE INFORMATION BACK THAT WAS NEEDED. UPON RETURNING AFTER THE WEEKEND WHEN MRS. DHALLA AGAIN REQUESTED THE PAPERWORK MS. GORDO STATED SHE HAD FORGOTTEN AND WOULD BRING IT THE FOLLOWING WEEK. MS. GORDO WORKED FOR A TOTAL OF 11 DAYS AND ON THE 12TH DAY INFORMED MRS. DHALLA HER RELATIVE HAD OBTAINED A JOB FOR HER AT THE HOSPITAL AND SHE WAS LEAVING IMMEDIATELY AS HER JOB WAS STARTING THAT DAY. WHEN MRS. DHALLA ENQUIRED HOW SHE HAD OBTAINED THE JOB, MS. GORDO STATED SHE HAD APPLIED A WHILE AGO.

2) Ms Gordo says she was interviewed for the job by you and your mother at the family home at [REDACTED] She said your former nanny Lyda Alvarez was also present. She said she took the job because you promised to fill out the proper paperwork for her to work legally as a caregiver. Did you make such a promise? Was any LMO ever obtained for Gordo?

NO SUCH PROMISE WAS MADE BY DR. DHALLA. THIS IS A FALSE AND BASELESS ALLEGATION. DR. DHALLA WAS ONLY PRESENT WHEN MS. GORDO FIRST CAME TO THE HOME FOR A FEW MINUTES. AND THEN HAD TO LEAVE. ALL INTERVIEWS WERE DONE BY MRS. DHALLA.

3)Ms Akemi says she dealt exclusively with you in placing three nannies at your family home. She also said she apprised you that Gordo had complained to her about not being paid and that you told her it had been take care about not being paid, and you said it had been taken care of.

Is this true?

DR. DHALLA WAS REFERRED TO AKEMI AND HER AGENCY BY A FRIEND AFTER HER MOTHER REQUIRED CARE. DR. DHALLA DID NOT KNOW AKEMI NOR HER AGENCY PRIOR. ALL THE INFORMATION PROVIDED BY AKEMI REGARDING THE CAREGIVERS WAS TRUSTED IN GOOD FAITH. DR. DHALLA WAS ONLY INVOLVED IN THE INITIAL REFERRAL. ALL INTERVIEWS, HIRING DECISIONS, AND PAYMENTS WERE MADE BY MRS. DHALLA. DR. DHALLA HAD ABSOLUTELY NO INVOLVEMENT. MRS. DHALLA CALLED AKEMI TO REQUEST HER TO FIND MS. GORDO SO THAT THE PENDING AMOUNT OWED TO HER COULD BE PAID. MRS. DHALLA ALSO OFFERED TO SEND IT TO AKEMI HOWEVER AKEMI STATED SHE DID NOT WANT TO GET INVOLVED. MRS. DHALLA THEN OFFERED TO MEET MS. GORDO AT A PLACE THAT WAS CONVENIENT TO MS. GORDO. ONCE FINAL PAYMENT HAD BEEN MADE TO MS. GORDO MRS. DHALLA PERSONALLY CALLED AKEMI TO INFORM HER THAT SHE HAD PAID MS. GORDO IN FULL.

4)Ms Akemi says you told her you could expedite the paperwork because of your position as an MP. Was any application made to sponsor Gordo as a caregiver, either by you or your mother. Why not?

THE ALLEGATION MADE BY AKEMI IS FALSE AND BASELESS. NO SUCH CLAIM WAS EVER MADE BY DR. DHALLA. DR. DHALLA ONCE AGAIN WAS IN NO WAY SHAPE OR FORM INVOLVED IN THE SPONSORING OF ANY CAREGIVER.

NO APPLICATION WAS MADE TO SPONSOR MS. GORDO BECAUSE SHE REFUSED TO PROVIDE ALL OF THE NECESSARY DOCUMENTS AND ON THE 12TH DAY DECIDED TO LEAVE IMMEDIATELY AS SHE STATED HER RELATIVE HAD OBTAINED A JOB FOR HER AT A HOSPITAL.

4)Ms Gordo alleges on one occasion she was taken to clean one of your family clinics in Mississauga. Your mother drove her there, and Sonya, who she believes is your cousin, and assistant, was also present when she cleaned the clinic. Is this true?

THIS IS A FALSE AND BASELESS ALLEGATION. NO CLINICS ARE OWNED BY DR. RUBY DHALLA. FURTHERMORE THE CLINIC HAS A PROFESSIONAL CLEANING SERVICE THAT CLEANS THE CLINIC ON A DAILY BASIS HENCE THE CLEANING SERVICE BY MS. GORDO WOULD NOT BE NEEDED. THERE IS A WRITTEN CONTRACT WITH THE DAILY CLEANING SERVICE AS PROOF. ON ONE OCCASION, MRS. DHALLA WENT TO RUN A FEW ERRANDS AND MS. GORDO REQUESTED TO ACCOMPANY HER. AT THAT TIME MRS. DHALLA BRIEFLY VISITED THE CLINIC TO PICK UP SONIA TO DROP HER HOME. AT NO TIME DURING THIS BRIEF VISIT WAS ANY TYPE OF WORK DONE AT THE CLINIC AS IT IS FULLY STAFFED.

5) Under the Live-in Care program rules, a homeowner is not allowed to share, or subcontract a nanny to anyone else. Ms Gordo says she was taken to clean Sonya's house on three occasions. She also says she shoveled snow until midnight. These duties have nothing to do with care giving. Did she clean Sonya's house? Did she shovel snow?

THIS IS ANOTHER FALSE AND BASELESS ALLEGATION. THE DHALLA FAMILY HAS FOR THE PAST 5 YEARS, HIRED AN INDIVIDUAL ON CONTRACT TO SHOVEL THE SNOW DURING THE WINTER AND TO CUT THE GRASS IN THE SUMMER. THERE IS PROOF OF THIS AND IT CAN BE EASILY VERIFIED. HENCE MS. GORDO WOULD NEVER HAVE TO SHOVEL THE SNOW. IN ADDITION, MS. GORDO HAS NEVER CLEANED SONYA'S HOME. IN THE 11 DAYS THAT MS. GORDO WORKED SHE ACCOMPANIED MRS. DHALLA ONLY ON ONE OCCASION, WHEN A BRIEF VISIT WAS MADE TO THE CLINIC AND SONYA WAS DROPPED AT HOME.

6) Ms Gordo says that shortly after you hired her, you requested her passport ostensibly to start the LMO application to hire here legally. She says you kept the passport in your possession until she left three weeks later. Is this true?

THIS IS ANOTHER FALSE AND BASELESS ALLEGATION AS MS. GORDO ONLY WORKED FOR A TOTAL OF 11 DAYS AND ON THE 12TH DAY MS. GORDO INFORMED DR. DHALLA SHE

WAS LEAVING. AT NO TIME DID MS. GORDO PROVIDE HER PASSPORT OR ANY OTHER INFORMATION THAT WAS REQUIRED TO START THE PROCESSING OF THE NECESSARY PAPERWORK. IT APPEARS THAT FOR THE 11 DAYS MS. GORDO STAYED IN THE DHALLA HOME SHE WAS WORKING ON OBTAINING EMPLOYMENT AT THE HOSPITAL AND HENCE THE REASON FOR HER RELUCTANCE TO PROVIDE ANY TYPE OF DOCUMENTS.

7)Gordo says that when she realized neither you nor your mother were in a position to sponsor her as a caregiver, you don't have any children and your mom is neither elderly or infirm, she decided to seek legal employment elsewhere.

DUE TO MRS. DHALLA'S PERSONAL HEALTH REASONS A CAREGIVER WAS REQUIRED FOR ASSISTANCE. MS. GORDO WAS INFORMED OF THIS BY MRS. DHALLA DURING HER INTERVIEW. MS. GORDO ADVISED MRS. DHALLA ON THE 12TH DAY THAT SHE WAS IMMEDIATELY LEAVING TO WORK IN THE HOSPITAL. MS. GORDO LEFT WITHOUT ANY TYPE OF NOTICE. AT THE TIME THAT MS. GORDO LEFT DR. DHALLA WAS NOT PRESENT AT THE HOME.

She claims you blew up at her and she left without being paid. Was she paid? Why not. She says she returned to the family home week later and that you threatened to have her deported unless she left your property. She claims a cab driver witnessed the entire incident. Did this happen?

NO SUCH THREATS IN ANY WAY, SHAPE OF FORM WERE MADE BY DR. DHALLA OR ANY MEMBER OF THE DHALLA FAMILY. WHEN MS. GORDO CAME TO MRS. DHALLA ON THE 12TH DAY AND INFORMED HER OF HER SUDDEN DEPARTURE MRS. DHALLA OFFERED TO PAY MS. GORDO VIA CHEQUE. MS. GORDO REFUSED AND REQUESTED CASH. ON ONE OCCASSION MS. GORDO SHOWED UP UNEXPECTEDLY AND WITHOUT ANY NOTICE TO THE HOME OF MRS. DHALLA AND DEMANDED HER OUTSTANDING PAYMENT IN CASH. MRS. DHALLA INFORMED MS. GORDO SHE COULD ONLY PAY HER VIA CHEQUES. MS. GORDO BECAME UPSET AND LEFT. NO THREATS OR LOUD EXCHANGES OF ANY SORT OCCURRED.

8)Ms Gordo says it took her almost a month after leaving to get her paid. Your mom met her at McDonalds at Square One and paid her \$400 in cash. Why cash and not a cheque? Can we see the receipt? Is it dated?

AFTER MS. GORDO'S DEPARTURE MRS. DHALLA MADE NUMEROUS ATTEMPTS TO CONTACT MS. GORDO. MS. GORDO DID NOT PICK UP MRS. DHALLA'S CALLS. MRS. DHALLA THEN SPOKE TO AKEMI TO ALSO REQUEST ASSISTANCE IN FINDING MS. GORDO TO GIVE HER THE FINAL PAYMENT. MRS. DHALLA ALSO ADVISED AKEMI SHE WOULD MEET WITH MS. GORDO WHERE IT WAS CONVENIENT FOR HER DUE TO THE LIMITATIONS OF PUBLIC TRANSIT. MS. GORDO SUGGESTED MCDONALD'S AT SQUARE ONE HENCE MRS. DHALLA AGREED. WHEN MRS. DHALLA MET WITH MS. GORDO SHE AGAIN REFUSED TO TAKE A CHEQUE AND THREATENED MRS. DHALLA SHE WOULD MAKE ALLEGATIONS AGAINST THE FAMILY IF A CASH PAYMENT WAS NOT MADE. MRS. DHALLA OBLIGED BECAUSE SHE DID NOT WANT TO DEAL WITH MS. GORDO AGAIN AND RELUCTANTLY PAID THE OUTSTANDING MONIES IN CASH. MS. GORDO WAS REQUESTED TO SIGN A RECEIPT ACKNOWLEDGING HER DAYS OF EMPLOYMENT AND PAYMENT OF ALL MONIES OWED. MS. GORDO REFUSED TO SIGN AND STATED SHE HAD BEEN ADVISED THAT SHE SHOULD NOT SIGN ANY TYPE OF PAPERS. MRS. DHALLA STATED SHE WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO PAY HER WITHOUT ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF RECEIPT OF THE MONEY. MS. GORDO FINALLY AGREED AND SIGNED THE RECEIPT. PROOF OF THIS RECEIPT IS AVAILABLE.

9) Anyone hiring a nanny as a live in caregiver must submit the appropriate taxes to the federal government on behalf of the employee. Was this done by either you or your family on behalf of Gordo?

MS. GORDO ONLY REMAINED IN THE HOME FOR A TOTAL OF 11 DAYS AND ALSO REFUSED TO PROVIDE THE INFORMATION NEEDED TO DO THE PAPERWORK, AS IT APPEARS THE DHALLA HOME WAS USED FOR HER AS A PLACE OF TRANSITION FROM ONE EMPLOYER TO THE NEXT.

10)After Gordo's departure, you hired another nanny who goes by the name of "Lynn". The Akemi gency says they dealt with you on this hiring also. It is my understanding that Lynn became concerned that her LMO was not forthcoming she phoned Service Canada to inquire about her status and whether you had applied for an LMO for her. Service Canada apparently called your home and your brother Neil took the call. He then admonished "Lynn" for having the nerve to inquire about her status. She left and some time later sought help from Intercede, a Toronto social agency that helps nannies, telling counsellors there that you had her passport. Intercede acknowledges they got involved in getting her

passport back. Can you comment on this? When was Lynn's passport returned to her? By whom? Why was it kept in the first place. Did you or anyone in your family ever apply for an LMO or a work permit for her?

LYNN WAS PROVIDED BY AKEMI AS THE PREVIOUS PLACEMENT MS. GORDO HAD LEFT. UPON LYNNS ARRIVAL INFORMATION AND HER PASSPORT WAS REQUESTED FROM HER TO START THE NECESSARY PAPERWORK FOR THE LMO. UPON COMPLETION OF THIS PAPERWORK, IT WAS FORWARDED TO HRSDC VIA FAX AND HER PASSPORT WAS RETURNED. A CONFIRMATION FAX LETTER WAS ALSO SHOWN TO LYNN. AFTER A FEW WEEKS WHEN NO RESPONSE HAD BEEN RECEIVED AN INQUIRY WAS DONE AND HRSDC ADVISED THAT THE FAX HAD NOT BEEN RECEIVED. THE PASSPORT WAS AGAIN REQUESTED BY MRS. DHALLA FOR THE COMPLETION OF THE LMO. THE PAPERWORK WAS AGAIN SENT TO HRSDC. A FEW WEEKS PASSED AND HRSDC CALLED THE DHALLA HOME WHEN LYNN WAS THE ONLY ONE HOME. LYNN ANSWERED THE PHONE AND ADVISED HRSDC SHE WAS NEIL'S SISTER. HRSDC THEN CALLED NEIL ON HIS MOBILE TO ADVISE HIM THAT LYNN WAS IMPERSONATING HIS SISTER WHEN THEY HAD CALLED THE HOUSE.

WHEN NEIL RETURNED HOME HE QUESTIONED LYNN IF HRSDC HAD CALLED THE HOUSE. LYNN STATED THAT NO ONE HAD CALLED. NEIL THEN CALLED HRSDC AND PUT THE OFFICER ON SPEAKER PHONE WHO STATED THAT SOMEONE IN A FILIPINO ACCENT HAD STATED SHE WAS NEIL'S SISTER. IN ADDITION THE OFFICER ADVISED THAT INQUIRES BY THE EMPLOYEE HAD BEEN MADE TO SERVICE CANADA. AT THIS POINT LYNN ADMITTED TO CALLING HRSDC AND TO MAKING THE FALSE REPRESENTATION. THEN UNEXPECTEDLY, LYNN'S BROTHER SHOWED UP AT THE DHALLA HOME. AT THAT TIME NEIL ADVISED LYNN'S BROTHER OF WHAT LYNN HAD DONE AND ALSO ADVISED BOTH OF THEM THAT HRSDC HAD CALLED TO CONFIRM THE LMO. BOTH MRS. DHALLA AND NEIL CONGRATULATED LYNN. LYNN STATED SHE WAS GOING HOME FOR THE WEEKEND AND WOULD RETURN ON MONDAY. MRS. DHALLA PAID HER THE OUTSTANDING AMOUNT SHE WAS OWED FOR THE TWO WEEKS. ON MONDAY LYNN NEVER RETURNED. MRS. DHALLA ATTEMPTED TO CONTACT LYNN HOWEVER WAS UNSUCCESSFUL. FINALLY MRS. DHALLA WAS ABLE TO CONTACT LYNN ON TUESDAY AT WHICH TIME LYNN INFORMED MRS. DHALLA SHE WAS NOT GOING TO BE RETURNING AS HER BROTHER NEEDED HER TO BABYSIT HIS KIDS. LYNN WAS ADVISED THAT NEIL WAS HER EMPLOYER AND HAD OBTAINED THE LMO FOR THE PURPOSE OF HER PROVIDING ASSISTANCE TO MRS. DHALLA. LYNN SAID SHE KNEW THE RULES AND WASN'T COMING BACK.

ONE DAY INTERCEDE CALLED NEIL AND STATED LYNN HAD CALLED AND HAD SAID A LMO HAD NOT BEEN FILED AND HER PASSPORT WAS BEING WITHHELD. HOWEVER NEIL ADVISED THE PERSON FROM INTERCEDE THAT HE HAD FILED THE LMO AND HAD PROOF AND HAD ABSOLUTELY NO INTEREST WHATSOEVER IN HOLDING LYNNS PASSPORT AND THAT HER PASSPORT HAD ONLY BEEN TAKEN TO PHOTOCOPY FOR THE PURPOSE OF THE LMO. NEIL HAD IMMEDIATELY RETURNED THE PASSPORT AND ALSO SHOWED LYNN PROOF THAT THE APPLICATION FOR A LMO HAD BEEN FILED.

LYNN DID NOT EVEN HAVE THE COURTESY TO CALL NEIL OR MRS. DHALLA TO ADVISE THAT SHE HAD NO INTENTION OF RETURNING AFTER THE LMO WAS APPROVED.

IT IS UNFORTUNATE DUE TO THE VERY PUBLIC NATURE OF MY SISTERS JOB AS MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT THAT MY FAMILY IS BEING EXPLOITED AND TAKEN ADVANTAGE OF FOR SOMEONE ELSE'S OWN PERSONAL GAIN.

(Dale Brazao's email to Ruby Dhalla, May 2, 2009)

Dear Ms. Ruby Dhalla:

Thank you for your recent communication.

I note you have not answered any of the questions which I posed in an earlier email addressed to you.

Although I appreciate the effort, you will understand having your brother speaking for you, is not the same as receiving your responses, especially since the serious allegations made by the two caregivers, were made against you, not your brother Neil Dhalla.

In the statement you released through your lawyer you say you have "no knowledge" of the details regarding the live-in caregivers who worked for your family and that you had "no involvement in the selection, interviewing, hiring, supervising, sponsoring or any financial transactions whatsoever with a live in care-giver for my family."

Both Ms Magdalene Gordo, who says she worked for your family from Feb 4 to Feb 22, 2008, and Ms Richelyn Tongson, who says she worked from Feb 22, to May 29, 2008, were clear that they were both interviewed, and hired, by you.

Gordo says a previous nanny, Lyda Alvarez, who quit working for your family after a few days, attended with her and sat through the entire interview with you and your mother Tavinder. Your brother Neil, she says, was not present.

Ms Gordo said you hired her that same day, and wanted her to start immediately, but she chose to have the weekend off and started on Monday, Feb 4.

Could I please have your comments on this. Were you not present at that interview?

Richelyn Tongson said she was interviewed by you alone, on Feb 22, 2008, and that your mother Tavinder was in Winnipeg at the time. Again, your brother was not present, she said. Tongson said you hired her and she started immediately as she had taken her belongings with her. You put her on a two week tryout, she said, making the hiring permanent when your mother arrived back at the home days later.

Could I please have your comments on this. Did you not interview her? Was your mother not in Winnipeg on that date?

Both women are also clear as to who asked for, and to whom they handed their passports and other personal documents. You did. Not your brother, and not your mother. Both say you told them you needed the documents to process their applications for LMO's and that you could do it very quickly because of your connections in Ottawa.

Gordo says you held on to her passport for two weeks, and Tongson, that you held on to her passport, birth certificate, marriage certificate and former work permits for more than two months. Both deny they handed their documents back after photocopying as your brother says in his email to me.

It was only after INTERCEDE intervened, by phoning you at your office in Ottawa, that she got her passport back. Intercede has confirmed they spoke to you about the matter. Tongson said she was in on the conference call between you and the Intercede counselor.

Can you please comment on this allegation.

Both women maintain they were taken to clean your cousin Sonya's home on a regular basis. She rents a basement apartment in a house owned by an Indian family, they say. Gordo said she did it three times in the three weeks she was employed by your family, Tongson says she was picked up by Sonya every Wednesday and taken to the apartment to clean it, and even make meals.

In addition she said she cleaned both of your brother's clinics on more than one occasion -- both at the Mississauga and the Brampton location.

What does cleaning your cousin's apartment and your brother's clinics have to do with care giving for your mother, the job both women were ostensibly hired to do?

Your mother worked alongside her on some occasions, other times she did it alone.

Did this happen?

Both women say they were instructed to shine Neil Dhalla's shoes every day, and make sure his suits were de-linted.

Tongson said she had to wash the family cars on more than one occasion.

None of these activities are remotely connected to the care-giver duties outlined under the Federal Live-In Caregiver program.

Can you comment on whether Tongson performed these duties.

Given that Tongson worked at your home for more than three months as a caregiver to your mother, were the mandatory federal taxes deducted on her behalf and were they submitted to the proper government agencies?

I attended at your family home at [xxx], in Mississauga, this afternoon after receiving the email from your brother Neil, that he has proof that applications were filed and an LMO received for Richelyn Tongson.

I asked to see that proof, but he refused to provide it suggesting he was "unavailable" today but might call me sometime next week.

Can you provide the dates that these LMO's were requested and when the documents were received by Service Canada?

In my conversation with you the other night, it was clear to me that you understood the regulations under the Live in Caregiver program. If that's the case, why were these women working at your family home, when neither had an LMO or a work permit?

In his email response your brother Neil sidestepped that crucial issue.

Could you please address it?

I understand you are back from Vancouver today. I would appreciate a timely answer to these questions. If you would like to fax me the copies of the LMO's and any other relevant documents, you can do so at 416-869-4151.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Dale Brazao
Toronto Star

416-869-4433

LAW OFFICE OF H. JOHN KALINA

7895 Tranmere Drive, Suite 214, Mississauga, Ontario Canada L5S 1V9

Telephone: (905) 456-8055

1-866-503-7354

Facsimile: (905) 487-9613

mail@lawyer4u.ca

www.lawyer4u.ca

Sunday, May 03, 2009

Refer to File Number: M09015

Dale Brazao, Reporter

The Toronto Star

1 Yonge Street, Toronto, Ontario

RE: Allegations against Dr. Ruby Dhalla

Thank you for your email of May 2, 2009.

Dr. Dhalla has already provided you with a written statement with respect to the allegations being made by Ms Magdalene Gordo, Ms Richelyn Tongson, Ms. Lyda Alvarez and Akemi Taniguchi.

These allegations are false and baseless. Dr. Dhalla had NO involvement in the selecting, interviewing, hiring, supervising, sponsoring, or any financial transactions whatsoever with a live-in caregiver for her family.

Dr. Dhalla requests that you direct your inquiries to the appropriate member of the family.

Sincerely,



H. John Kalina

LAW OFFICE OF H. JOHN KALINA

7895 Tranmere Drive, Suite 214, Mississauga, Ontario Canada L5S 1V9

Telephone: (905) 456-8055

1-866-503-7354

Facsimile: (905) 487-9613

mail@lawyer4u.ca

www.lawyer4u.ca

Sunday, May 03, 2009

Refer to File Number: M09015

Dale Brazao, Reporter

The Toronto Star

1 Yonge Street, Toronto, Ontario

RE: Statement of Dr. Neil Dhalla

An email has been forwarded to my client, Dr. Neil Dhalla, in regards to allegations being made by Ms. Magdalene Gordo, Ms. Richelyn Tongson, Ms. Lyda Alvarez and Akemi Taniguchi against Dr. Ruby Dhalla, the sister of my client. I wish to advise you on behalf of my client that Dr. Ruby Dhalla has had absolutely NO involvement in this matter. Your questions regarding the allegations by the live-in caregivers should be directed towards the appropriate member of the Dhalla family, which is my client.

My client has advised me that you paid an unexpected visit to his residence and demanded to meet with him and to be provided with copies of documentation pertaining to this matter. I would like to advise you that in the future please direct all correspondence and questions directly to my office.

As per your request, I have attached copies of documentation you had requested. After carefully reviewing the documents it is abundantly **clear** that the allegations being made are false and inaccurate. Furthermore based on the evidence contained in the documents it is evident that there are numerous inconsistencies and inaccuracies in the statements and allegations being made by the caregivers. The documents provide factual evidence as to the true dates of service, and fees paid. Furthermore these documents are signed by the caregivers and in the case of Ms. Gordo include an acknowledgement of payment and confirmation of no further outstanding amounts. These are written in her own handwriting. Ms. Gordo states that she had allegedly worked for 3 weeks however the documents clearly indicate otherwise.

In addition, Ms. Gordo states her passport was held for 2 weeks. This was not possible, since Ms. Gordo only worked for a period of 11 days for my client. During that period she refused to provide my client and his mother with any of the legal documents verifying her status nor any other information which was required to process her application.

At no point did Ms. Tongson provide any legal documents other than her passport which was needed for the processing her application. You state that Intercede spoke to my client's sister. I understand that this was done at the initiative of Ms. Tongson. Upon speaking to my client's sister, Intercede was referred to my client as he was the sponsor. My client's sister and her office had no involvement with Ms. Tongson. You state in your email that Ms. Tongson alleges she handed her passport to my client's sister and received it back from

my client's sister, however, Ms. Tongson has signed documentation stating her passport was taken and returned by the sponsor which is my client, Dr. Neil Dhalla. This once again is a false and baseless allegation by Ms. Tongson that is backed by proof with Ms. Tongson's own handwriting.

Your email also asked for the dates the LMO was requested. Attached is documentation identifying the LMO for Ms. Tongson. It was requested on April 14, 2008 and an approval received on May 30, 2008. The first LMO paperwork sent to Service Canada by my client was apparently not received by them hence the paperwork was received a second time.

In addition, Akemi Taniguchi's agency was retained to facilitate the necessary requirements for the sponsorship of a live-in caregiver by my client. It was the responsibility of the agency and of the caregivers to ensure that all appropriate steps were followed and all legal documents in place prior to commencing work. My client had accepted all information provided by the agency and by the caregivers as true and in good faith.

It was always my client's intention to deduct the statutory source deductions from his employee's pay. His intention was to deduct the appropriate amounts once he received their SIN numbers and a valid work permit listing him as their employer. The caregivers left prior to the documentation being ready, therefore he never had an opportunity to hire them as employees. My client treated the situation as a contract payment for services that his mother imminently required and obtained a receipt from the caregivers which confirms no deductions were ever taken. Accordingly he had nothing to remit.

Attached are:

- 1) Copies of receipts which verify that both Ms. Gordo and Ms. Tongson were paid in full and no other outstanding payments were remaining. All of these documents are signed by both Ms. Gordo and Ms. Tongson.
- 2) A copy of the application for the LMO made on April 14, 2008 and a copy of the approval received on May 30, 2008 from HRSDC. As you will see the application was made and my client was the sponsor.
- 3) A letter from Ms. Tongson stating she gave her passport to my client and that it was returned by my client to her.

If necessary, my client will also be able to provide you with proof that he has had an individual for the past 5 years who has been hired to shovel his snow and cut his grass hence Ms. Gordo's claim that she had to shovel snow is false and baseless. In addition, my client can also provide proof that he has cleaners for his clinics that clean on a daily basis hence Ms. Gordo's and Ms. Tongson's claims are again clearly ludicrous.

It seems evident that my client and his mother are victims of both an unscrupulous agency and caregivers who are attempting to exploit my client and his family's name for their own personal advantage. It also seems that these individuals may be trying to deflect attention from their own misdeeds and misrepresentations.

There are questions that remain regarding why the caregivers were sent by the agency without appropriate documents, how they arrived in Canada and why they were jumping from employer to employer.

At all times, the live-in caregivers were treated with the utmost respect, care and compassion by my client and his family. The above information and documents attached provide you with the true facts surrounding the allegations and the necessary proof you need for verification. It is clear the unsubstantiated allegations are

false and baseless and that my client, because of his name, is being used as a dupe and pawn by people desperate to remain in Canada at any cost.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'HJK' or similar initials, written in a cursive style.

H. John Kalina
Encls.